MINISTRY OF FINANCE OF THE REPUBLIC OF ARMENIA



EVALUATION REPORT FOR INCLUDING IN THE LONG LIST OF AUDITORS UNDER BSB CBC PROGRAMME

CONTENT

| INTRODUCTION | . 3 |
|--|-----|
| DEFINED CRITERIA AND REQUIRED DOCUMENTS | . 4 |
| APPLICANTS | . 5 |
| EVALUATION | . 6 |
| LONG LIST | . 7 |
| ANNEX 1. CHECKLIST OF EVALUATION OF INTERESTED AUDIT COMPANIES | . 8 |
| ANNEX 2. LONG LIST OF AUDIT COMPANIES | 11 |

INTRODUCTION

At the end of each call for proposals under the BSB CBC programme, after completion of the selection of the applied project proposals the National Control Contact Point (Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Armenia) announces an open call for development the list of external auditors eligible for conducting expenditure verification in the framework of the BSB CBC Programme.

In this regard, for collection of corresponding applications Public Sector Accounting Methodology and Reporting Monitoring Department of the MOF (hereafter Department) has published an announcement on MOF official website on 05 October 2018 with deadline of 05 November 2018. The Department has also notified all audit companies licensed by the MOF by official letters, by e-mail and by phone.

The audit companies who provided all the necessary documents and received a positive decision of the Ministry of Finance have been included in the long list of audit companies and in the future may be selected by beneficiaries of the BSB CBC Programme to verify expenditure of the project.

DEFINED CRITERIA AND REQUIRED DOCUMENTS

To be included in the list of auditors of the BSB CBC programme all auditors should have complied with the following **criteria**:

- To be a legal entity holding auditing license provided by the Ministry of Finance of RA
- To have at least five years working experience in the Armenian audit service market
- To have an experience of auditing at least 3 projects financed by international donors during last 5 years
- To have at least one member of audit team having at least 3 years of experience in auditing and holding one of the following international qualifications: ACCA, CPA, CFA or equivalent
- Half of audit team members should hold qualification of auditor provided by the Ministry of Finance of RA
- All members of audit team should be proficient in English.

The following **documents** should have been presented by the interested audit companies:

- copy of a license for rendering audit services in Armenia provided by the Ministry of Finance of RA
- documents confirming that audit company has experience in auditing of at least 3 projects financed by international donors during the last 5 years
- list of audit team members and their CVs
- copies of qualification certificates of audit team members and confirmation that those certificates are in force
- confirmation that all suggested audit team members are proficient in English.

APPLICANTS

The following audit companies have applied under the call:

| NN | Name of audit company | Date of application |
|----|--------------------------------|---------------------|
| 1 | YEREVAN-AUDIT CONSULT | 17/10/2018 |
| 2 | PRICEWATERHOUSECOOPERS ARMENIA | 25/10/2018 |
| 3 | AN AUDIT | 31/10/2018 |
| 4 | BDO ARMENIA | 01/11/2018 |
| 5 | DELOITTE ARMENIA | 03/11/2018 |
| 6 | AMH AUDIT | 05/11/2018 |
| 7 | GRANT THORNTON ARMENIA | 05/11/2018 |
| 8 | ASATRYANS | 05/11/2018 |
| 9 | BAKER TILLY ARMENIA | 05/11/2018 |
| 10 | PHP AUDIT | 05/11/2018 |

EVALUATION

Evaluation of the applicants has been implemented based on the documents provided by the applied audit companies using the checklist of evaluation of interested audit companies (Annex 1). All the applicants have been evaluated against the criteria published in the announcement under the call.

The evaluation results are the following:

| NN | Name of audit company | Result | Reason for non- qualification |
|----|-----------------------------------|-------------------|---|
| 1 | YEREVAN-AUDIT CONSULT | Non- qualified | None of audit team members holds international qualification |
| 2 | PRICEWATERHOUSECOOPERS ARMENIA | Qualified | |
| 3 | AN AUDIT | Qualified | |
| 4 | BDO ARMENIA | Qualified | |
| 5 | DELOITTE ARMENIA | Qualified | |
| 6 | AMH AUDIT | Qualified | |
| 7 | GRANT THORNTON ARMENIA | Qualified | |
| 8 | ASATRYANS | Non- qualified | Operates in the Armenian audit service market for less than five years |
| 9 | BAKER TILLY ARMENIA | Qualified | |
| 10 | PHP AUDIT | Qualified | |

The detailed information about the evaluation of applications is presented in Annex 1 of this report.

LONG LIST

The applied audit companies which meet the criteria published in the announcement of the MOF are included in the long list of audit companies and in the future may be selected by beneficiaries of the BSB CBC Programme to verify expenditure of the project

Based on the evaluation results the following companies have been included in the long list:

| NN | Name of audit company |
|----|--------------------------------|
| 1 | PRICEWATERHOUSECOOPERS ARMENIA |
| 2 | AN AUDIT |
| 3 | BDO ARMENIA |
| 4 | DELOITTE ARMENIA |
| 5 | AMH AUDIT |
| 6 | GRANT THORNTON ARMENIA |
| 7 | BAKER TILLY ARMENIA |
| 8 | PHP AUDIT |

The long list of audit companies will be published in the official website of the MOF www.minfin.am with the information and form presented in Annex 2 of this document (Long list of audit companies).

ANNEX 1. CHECKLIST OF EVALUATION OF INTERESTED AUDIT COMPANIES

| | | Criteria | | | | | | | |
|---|-----------------------------------|---|--|--|--|---|---|---|-------------------|
| N | Full name of audit company | Company holds auditing license provided by MOF | Company operates in the Armenian audit service market for not less than five years | Company has experience in auditing of at least 3 projects financed by international donors during last 5 years | At least one member of audit team has at least 3 years of experience in auditing and holds international qualification | Half of audit team members hold qualification of auditor provided by MOF | All members of audit team are proficient in English | Contacts of the company (auditor): Address, Phone, E-mail | Decision |
| 1 | YEREVAN-AUDIT CONSULT | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | Baghramyan avenue 3, Yerevan, +37410522073, info@yerevanaudit.am | Non- qualified |
| 4 | PRICEWATERHOUSECOOPERS ARMENIA | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Northern avenue 1, NORD Business Centre, 6th floor, Yerevan, +37410512151 office.yerevan@am.pwc.com | Qualified |
| | AN AUDIT | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Gyulbenkyan 30/3, office 129, Yerevan, Tel. +37460529021 office@anaudit.am | Qualified |
| 2 | BDO ARMENIA | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Davit Anhaght 23/6, 5-th floor office 7, Yerevan, Tel. +37460528899 bdo@bdoarmenia.am | Qualified |

| | | Criteria | | | | | | | |
|----|----------------------------|---|---|--|--|---|---|--|-------------------|
| Nº | Full name of audit company | Company holds auditing license provided by MOF | Company operates in the Armenian audit service market for not less than five years | Company has experience in auditing of at least 3 projects financed by international donors during last 5 years | At least one member of audit team has at least 3 years of experience in auditing and holds international qualification | Half of audit team members hold qualification of auditor provided by MOF | All members of audit team are proficient in English | Contacts of the company (auditor): Address, Phone, E-mail | Decision |
| 5 | DELOITTE ARMENIA | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Business Center "Imperium Plaza", 4/7 Amiryan St., Yerevan, Tel: +37410526520 amdeloitte@deloitte.am | Qualified |
| 6 | AMH AUDIT | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Arshakunyats ave. 2, office 315, Yerevan, Tel. +37460623251 amhaudit@amhaudit.am | Qualified |
| 7 | GRANT THORNTON ARMENIA | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Vagharshyan str. 8/1, Yerevan, Tel: +37410260964 gta@am.gt.com | Qualified |
| 8 | ASATRYANS | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Sakharov Business center Nalbandyan 48/1, 5-th floor, Yerevan, Tel: +3746532323, general@asatryans.com | Non- qualified |
| 9 | BAKER TILLY ARMENIA | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Hanrapetutyan str. 22, Yerevan, Tel: +37410544301 info@bakertillyarmenia.com | Qualified |

| | | Criteria | | | | | | | |
|----|----------------------------|---|--|--|--|---|---|---|-----------|
| Nº | Full name of audit company | Company holds auditing license provided by MOF | Company operates in the Armenian audit service market for not less than five years | Company has experience in auditing of at least 3 projects financed by international donors during last 5 years | At least one member of audit team has at least 3 years of experience in auditing and holds international qualification | Half of audit team members hold qualification of auditor provided by MOF | All members of audit team are proficient in English | Contacts of the company (auditor): Address, Phone, E-mail | Decision |
| 10 | PHP AUDIT | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Adonts str. 2, Yeraz Business Centre Yerevan, Tel: +37410204090 general@php.am | Qualified |

ANNEX 2. LONG LIST OF AUDIT COMPANIES

| Nº | Name of audit company | Address | Contact information (Contact person, telephone number, e-mail) | Website |
|----|-----------------------------------|--|---|-----------------------------------|
| 1 | PRICEWATERHOUSECOOPERS ARMENIA | Yerevan, Northern avenue 1, NORD Business Centre, 6th floor | Tel: +37410512151 office.yerevan@am.pwc.com Lusine Tarlamazyan | https://www.pwc.com/am/ |
| 2 | AN AUDIT | Yerevan, Gyulbenkyan 30/3, office 129 | Tel: +37460529021 office@anaudit.am Artur Harutyunyan | http://anaudit.am/ |
| 3 | BDO ARMENIA | Yerevan, Davit Anhaght 23/6, 5-th floor office 7 | Tel: +37460528899 bdo@bdoarmenia.am Lusine Ghazaryan | http://www.bdoarmenia.am/ |
| 4 | DELOITTE ARMENIA | Yerevan, Business Center "Imperium Plaza", 4/7 Amiryan St. | Tel: +37410526520 <u>amdeloitte@deloitte.am</u> Anna Bardakhchyan | https://www2.deloitte.com/am/ |
| 5 | AMH AUDIT | Yerevan, Arshakunyats ave. 2, office 315 | Tel: +37460623251 amhaudit@amhaudit.am Aram Hovhannisyan | http://www.amhaudit.am/ |
| 6 | GRANT THORNTON ARMENIA | Yerevan, Vagharshyan str. 8/1 | Tel: +37410260964 <u>gta@am.gt.com</u> Lusine Margaryan | http://www.grantthornton.am/ |
| 7 | BAKER TILLY ARMENIA | Yerevan, Hanrapetutyan str. 22 | Tel: +37410544301 info@bakertillyarmenia.com Karine Araqelyan | http://www.bakertillyarmenia.com/ |
| 8 | PHP AUDIT | Yerevan, Adonts str. 2, Yeraz Business Centre | Tel: +37410204090 <u>general@php.am</u> Lilit Minasyan | http://www.php.am/ |